

## How Do Offline Brand Community Sustain Customer Retention Beyond Transactional Loyalty?

Regina Dinanti Widodo<sup>1\*</sup>, A.A Ngr. Oka Suryadinatha Gorda<sup>1</sup>, Ngurah Keshawa Satya Santiarsa<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Management, Universitas Pendidikan Nasional, Bali, Indonesia

\*Corresponding Email: [reginawidodo@gmail.com](mailto:reginawidodo@gmail.com)

### ARTICLE INFORMATION

#### Publication information

#### Research article

#### HOW TO CITE

Widodo, R. D., Gorda, A. A. N. O. S., & Santiarsa, N. K. S. (2026). How do offline brand community sustain customer retention beyond transactional loyalty?. *International Journal of Accounting and Finance in Asia Pacific*, 9(1), 305–317.

#### DOI:

<https://doi.org/10.32535/ijafap.v9i1.4408>

Copyright@ 2026 owned by Author(s).  
Published by IJAFAP



This is an open-access article.

License:

Attribution-Noncommercial-Share Alike  
(CC BY-NC-SA)

Received: 13 December 2025

Accepted: 19 January 2026

Published: 20 February 2026

#### ABSTRACT

As markets become increasingly saturated and consumers engage in multi-brand usage, transactional explanations of customer retention are becoming less sufficient, particularly in the beauty industry where consumer engagement is strongly influenced by social interaction and identity formation. This study aims to examine how customer retention intention is socially constructed within an offline brand-initiated community by exploring Wardah Beauty Circle Denpasar in Indonesia. Using a qualitative approach through in-depth interviews, participant observation, and documentation, this study investigates how members experience and interpret community participation within a culturally plural context. The findings reveal that customer retention intention emerges as a relational process shaped by emotional safety, identity co-construction, everyday relational interaction, and the negotiation of social tensions and product preference differences. Rather than being driven solely by repeated purchasing behavior, retention reflects relational continuity grounded in emotional attachment and a sense of belonging within the community. The study concludes that offline brand communities can strengthen long-term consumer–brand relationships by fostering emotionally supportive and interaction-rich environments that encourage identity-based belonging beyond conventional repeat-purchase strategies.

**Keywords:** Beauty Industry; Brand Community; Consumer–Brand Relationships; Customer Retention; Offline Brand Activation; Relational Loyalty

## **INTRODUCTION**

In increasingly competitive and saturated markets, customer retention has become a central yet increasingly complex concern in marketing and consumer behavior research. Traditional explanations of retention which anchored in satisfaction, switching costs, and repeat purchase behavior, are progressively challenged by contemporary consumption patterns marked by brand experimentation, multi-brand usage, and fluid consumer identities (Hollebeek & Macky, 2019). In such contexts, continued attachment to a brand cannot be adequately explained through transactional metrics alone (Santos et al., 2022). Consumers today are exposed to a constant stream of alternatives, algorithmically curated recommendations, limited-edition collaborations, and peer-generated reviews that encourage trial and comparison. Loyalty, therefore, is no longer a default outcome of satisfaction; it is something that must be continuously nurtured, negotiated, and reaffirmed.

At the same time, digitalization has fundamentally altered how consumers relate to brands. Social media platforms, online marketplaces, and creator-driven cultures have normalized rapid shifts in preferences. Individuals can admire one brand today, experiment with another tomorrow, and publicly document that transition in real time. This fluidity does not necessarily signal disloyalty in a traditional sense, but it does complicate managerial assumptions that repeat purchase equates to deep attachment. Consumers increasingly view brands as part of a broader repertoire of identity resources rather than as exclusive commitments (Santos et al., 2022). As a result, retention strategies grounded solely in economic incentives or promotional tactics often struggle to produce enduring relational bonds.

In response, brands have increasingly adopted community-based strategies to cultivate deeper and more enduring relationships with consumers. Brand communities are understood as social collectives in which consumers interact, share meanings, and co-construct identities related to a focal brand (Pedeliento et al., 2020). Rather than functioning solely as marketing channels, brand communities increasingly operate as social spaces where emotional attachment, belonging, and commitment are produced through everyday interaction (Huangfu et al., 2022; Zhang et al., 2023). Within these spaces, consumers do not merely receive brand messages; they actively reinterpret them, connect them to personal narratives, and embed them into social relationships.

The appeal of community-based strategies lies in their capacity to transform consumption from an individual act into a shared experience. When consumers gather whether online or offline around a brand, they exchange stories of product use, discuss aspirations, validate each other's choices, and sometimes even defend the brand against criticism (Huangfu et al., 2022). Through such interactions, the brand becomes more than a product provider; it becomes a symbolic anchor around which relationships are formed. Importantly, this process cannot be reduced to simple engagement metrics. The meaning of participation varies across members, shaped by personal histories, cultural contexts, and social positions. Yet, despite growing interest in brand communities, much of the existing literature continues to approach customer retention as an outcome to be measured, rather than as a socially embedded process to be examined.

This limitation is particularly evident in research on brand-initiated communities, where community formation is strategically facilitated by firms but lived and interpreted by consumers in diverse ways. While prior studies have demonstrated that participation in brand communities can enhance engagement and loyalty, they often overlook how retention is negotiated through everyday practices, relational dynamics, and identity work within the community itself (Abdiwan, 2025; Novianti & Balqiah, 2023). As a result, the

mechanisms through which community participation translates into sustained brand attachment remain insufficiently understood. There is still limited clarity regarding how members interpret their involvement: Do they perceive the community primarily as a marketing extension of the brand, or as a genuine social space? How do feelings of comfort, recognition, or shared experience shape their long-term orientation toward the brand?

Moreover, participation in brand communities is rarely uniform. Some members may attend events regularly and develop close interpersonal ties, while others participate sporadically or observe from the margins. These varying degrees of involvement can produce different forms of attachment. For certain individuals, the community may become a meaningful source of friendship and support, thereby deepening their commitment to the brand. For others, participation may remain instrumental or situational (Novianti & Balqiah, 2023). Without examining these nuances, retention risks being conceptualized as a linear outcome rather than as a layered and dynamic process.

These issues become especially salient in the beauty industry, where consumption is closely tied to identity construction, self-expression, and social evaluation. Beauty brands do not merely offer functional value but actively participate in shaping narratives of self-care, confidence, and belonging (Abdiwan, 2025; LoyaltyLion, 2025; Skålén et al., 2023). Choices related to skincare or cosmetics often carry symbolic meanings associated with lifestyle, values, and aspirations. Consumers may align themselves with brands that reflect how they wish to be seen or how they see themselves. In this context, community-based initiatives are not simply engagement tools but sites where consumers negotiate personal and social meanings related to beauty and identity.

Beauty consumption is also embedded in social comparison processes. Individuals frequently seek validation, advice, and reassurance from peers regarding product efficacy and suitability. Offline gatherings, workshops, and discussion forums can provide spaces where such exchanges occur in embodied and emotionally resonant ways. Within these interactions, members may share insecurities, celebrate transformations, or discuss challenges related to skin conditions and appearance (Santos et al., 2022). These shared moments can foster a sense of emotional safety and mutual understanding that extends beyond product performance. Yet, empirical research that examines beauty brand communities as lived social spaces particularly in offline settings remains limited.

Against this backdrop, Wardah Beauty Circle represents a particularly relevant empirical context. As a brand-initiated community developed by Wardah, one of Indonesia's leading beauty brands, Wardah Beauty Circle is designed to foster closer relationships with consumers through offline activities, social interaction, and shared experiences. The community operates across different regions in Indonesia, including Bali, where cultural pluralism and non-Muslim majority dynamics complicate conventional assumptions about brand attachment based on religious or ideological alignment. In such a setting, consumer retention cannot be assumed to emerge naturally from brand positioning alone but must be actively constructed through relational and social processes within the community (Alhaq, 2025; Asia, 2024).

The Balinese context is particularly significant because it introduces layers of cultural negotiation into the experience of brand community participation. Wardah is widely associated with halal beauty positioning, yet Bali's demographic composition challenges simplified narratives of religious homogeneity. Members may join Wardah Beauty Circle not primarily because of shared religious identity, but due to social curiosity, product interest, or relational invitations. This raises important questions about how community

participation reshapes brand meaning in pluralistic settings. Does the community serve as a bridge that transcends perceived identity boundaries? Or does it reinforce particular narratives of belonging? Understanding these dynamics is essential for unpacking how retention is constructed in culturally diverse environments.

Despite its strategic prominence, little is known about how Wardah Beauty Circle is actually experienced and interpreted by its members, or how participation in the community shapes their intention to remain connected to the brand over time. Existing studies on Wardah largely focus on brand image, halal positioning, or consumer attitudes, offering limited insight into the lived dynamics of its community-based initiatives. This gap underscores the need for research that moves beyond outcome-oriented evaluations and instead examines how brand communities function as social infrastructures through which attachment and retention are enacted in everyday life.

By foregrounding Wardah Beauty Circle as a site of relational engagement, this study responds to calls within consumer behavior research to adopt more context-sensitive and process-oriented approaches to understanding customer retention. Rather than treating retention as a behavioral endpoint, the study positions it as an ongoing relational phenomenon shaped by emotional safety, identity negotiation, and social interaction within the community. In doing so, it seeks to illuminate how retention unfolds through conversations, shared rituals, mutual support, and subtle forms of recognition that accumulate over time (Chavadi et al., 2023; Novianti & Balqiah, 2023; Pertiwi, 2024; Sa'adah, 2010).

Ultimately, examining retention as a socially embedded process allows for a richer understanding of why consumers choose to stay connected to a brand in environments characterized by abundant alternatives. It shifts attention from isolated transactions to relational continuity, from satisfaction scores to lived experiences, and from managerial intentions to member interpretations. Through this lens, Wardah Beauty Circle is not merely an engagement program but a dynamic social arena where attachment is cultivated, contested, and sustained.

## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

The theoretical foundation of this study is primarily rooted in Social Identity Theory (SIT), which explains how individuals construct their self-concept based on their membership in social groups. According to Tajfel and Turner (2004), identity is not solely personal but also socially derived through processes of categorization, identification, and comparison. Individuals categorize themselves into groups, internalize group values as part of their identity, and compare their in-group favorably against others to maintain positive self-esteem. Within the context of brand communities, this theory becomes highly relevant because consumers do not merely engage with products but also associate themselves with symbolic groups that reflect shared meanings and values. When individuals participate in a brand community, they may begin to perceive the brand as part of their social identity (Lau et al., 2023). In culturally diverse environments such as Denpasar, Bali, where social and religious contexts differ from Wardah's primary halal positioning, identity formation within the Wardah Beauty Circle may rely more on shared experiences, lifestyle alignment, and collective engagement rather than purely religious symbolism. Thus, belonging to the community may shape members' self-perception and influence their intention to maintain a long-term relationship with the brand.

In addition to Social Identity Theory, this study adopts the Marketing as Practice (MaP) perspective, which shifts the understanding of marketing from a purely strategic managerial function to a set of socially embedded activities performed in everyday life

(Skålén et al., 2023). Rather than viewing marketing as something organizations design and consumers passively receive, MaP conceptualizes marketing as a series of routines, interactions, and collaborative practices that generate value. This framework highlights three interrelated elements: practices, practitioners, and praxis. Practices refer to recurrent activities; practitioners are the actors who perform them; and praxis represents the collective realization of value creation. Within Wardah Beauty Circle, marketing is not limited to promotional campaigns but is enacted through beauty workshops, wellness sessions, discussions, and shared interactions among members. Through repeated participation, members co-create meaning and value alongside the brand. These shared experiences embed the brand into members' everyday social life, strengthening emotional attachment and relational bonds that may contribute to customer retention intention (Fitri & Kumenaung, 2025).

The concept of Relationship Marketing further strengthens this theoretical foundation by emphasizing the importance of long-term engagement built upon trust and commitment rather than transactional exchange (Morgan & Hunt, 1994). The Commitment-Trust Theory suggests that enduring relationships are sustained when consumers develop confidence in the brand and perceive mutual value. In competitive industries such as cosmetics, where product differentiation can be easily replicated, emotional connection and relational quality become decisive factors. Brand communities serve as relational platforms that allow consumers to build familiarity, emotional security, and trust through continuous interaction. In the case of Wardah Beauty Circle in Denpasar, the community acts as a bridge that connects brand values with consumer experiences, fostering a sense of recognition and appreciation among members. This relational dynamic may enhance attachment and reduce the likelihood of switching to competing brands.

Furthermore, the concept of Brand-Initiated Customer Community (BICC) is central to understanding how companies strategically create structured communities to strengthen customer relationships (Raichur et al., 2025). Unlike organically formed communities, BICCs are intentionally facilitated and aligned with brand objectives. Prior studies indicate that participation in such communities enhances trust, emotional attachment, brand equity, and loyalty. However, much of the existing literature concentrates on online brand communities and relies heavily on quantitative approaches. Limited research explores offline brand communities within culturally specific contexts. Wardah Beauty Circle in Denpasar represents an offline BICC that integrates education, wellness, beauty discussions, and social interaction. Through this physical and experiential engagement, members may develop a stronger sense of belonging and collective identity. Such experiences may deepen emotional bonds more effectively than purely digital interaction, thereby influencing retention intention.

Customer Retention Intention, in this study, is understood as the consumer's willingness to continue purchasing and maintaining a relationship with a brand in the future. Contemporary research suggests that retention is not solely driven by satisfaction with product performance but also by emotional engagement, identity alignment, and community participation. While previous studies have demonstrated positive relationships between brand community involvement and loyalty, many treat retention as a measurable outcome influenced by isolated variables (Wongsansukcharoen, 2022). Fewer studies examine the subjective meanings and lived experiences that shape retention decisions. In this research, retention intention is conceptualized as a socially constructed outcome emerging from identity congruence, emotional attachment, and relational trust cultivated through community participation.

Overall, the literature indicates that brand communities can foster loyalty by integrating identity formation, shared practice, and relational engagement. Social Identity Theory

explains how belonging influences behavior; Marketing as Practice highlights how value is co-created through routine interaction; Relationship Marketing emphasizes trust and commitment; and Brand-Initiated Customer Community research demonstrates the strategic role of structured communities in building long-term engagement. By integrating these perspectives, this study seeks to understand how Wardah Beauty Circle functions as a social arena where identity, experience, and relational meaning converge, ultimately shaping customer retention intention within the competitive beauty industry.

## **RESEARCH METHOD**

This study employs a qualitative research design to explore how customer retention intention is socially constructed within a brand-initiated community. A qualitative approach was chosen to capture lived experiences, relational dynamics, and meaning-making processes that extend beyond transactional indicators of loyalty. The empirical context of the study is Wardah Beauty Circle Denpasar, an offline brand community developed by Wardah, selected for its active engagement and its operation within Bali's culturally plural environment.

Data were collected over an extended period from October 2024 to February 2025 to allow sustained immersion in the research setting. Three complementary techniques were used: in-depth interviews, participant observation, and documentation. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with purposively selected informants, including active community members who had participated consistently in offline activities and used Wardah products for a minimum of three years, as well as one brand representative and one marketing expert to provide internal and external perspectives. Participant observation was carried out during multiple community activities to capture interaction patterns, relational practices, and situational dynamics as they naturally unfolded, while documentation supported contextual understanding of community activities.

Data analysis followed an iterative and interpretive process, involving continuous movement between data collection and thematic interpretation. Interview transcripts, field notes, and documentary materials were systematically coded to identify recurring patterns related to social interaction, identity construction, emotional attachment, and retention intention. Constant comparison across data sources and informants was applied to refine themes and ensure analytical coherence. To enhance trustworthiness, the study employed triangulation of sources, methods, and situations, allowing findings to be examined from multiple perspectives and contexts. Reflexive engagement was maintained throughout the research process to ensure that interpretations remained grounded in participants' accounts and to minimize researcher bias. These procedures collectively support the credibility and rigor of the study.

## **RESULT**

This study explored the lived experiences of members of Wardah Beauty Circle Denpasar as a brand-initiated customer community and examined how these experiences shape customer retention intention beyond transactional loyalty. Data were collected in Denpasar, Bali, from October 2024 to February 2025 through in-depth interviews, participant observation, and field documentation. The analysis identified four interconnected themes: social safety within community interaction, identity co-construction, everyday relational practices, and retention intention rooted in relational continuity rather than repeated purchase behavior. In addition, the findings revealed the presence of interpersonal tensions and differences in product preferences that influenced the dynamics of community engagement.

Participants consistently described Wardah Beauty Circle as a safe and supportive environment where they could express personal experiences and emotions without fear of judgment. One participant explained:

“I feel seen here, not just as a customer, but as a person with real struggles and real stories.”

This statement reflects how members experienced the community as more than a promotional space. Emotional support, acceptance, and interpersonal recognition became important aspects of participation. Several participants explained that they felt more comfortable sharing personal concerns and engaging in discussion because the community atmosphere encouraged openness and mutual respect. Within the culturally diverse context of Denpasar, this sense of emotional safety appeared to strengthen members' willingness to remain involved in the community over time.

The findings also show that members did not simply adopt an identity shaped by the brand's marketing communication. Instead, identity was continuously negotiated through interaction, shared experiences, and collective reflection. Participants associated their involvement in Wardah Beauty Circle with self-development, friendship, and shared aspirations rather than with exclusive product consumption alone. Some participants even described the community as part of their personal journey and social environment. These experiences suggest that attachment to the community was constructed through shared meanings and ongoing relational interaction among members.

Beyond identity formation, participants repeatedly emphasized the importance of everyday interaction in sustaining engagement. Informal communication, casual greetings, follow-up conversations after events, and reciprocal interaction through social media were perceived as meaningful forms of relational maintenance. One participant stated:

“The real sense of community for me comes after the event, in those small chats and follow-ups.”

This statement illustrates that community attachment was maintained not only through formal activities but also through continuous interpersonal interaction in everyday settings. Routine communication helped strengthen familiarity, trust, and emotional closeness among members. Several participants explained that small interactions made them feel remembered, appreciated, and socially connected even outside scheduled community activities.

Another important finding concerns the presence of conflict within the community. Participants acknowledged that differences in product preferences, communication styles, and social expectations occasionally created tension among members. Some participants openly admitted using products from competing beauty brands while remaining actively involved in Wardah Beauty Circle. Despite these differences, participants generally viewed disagreement as a normal part of social interaction that could be managed through open communication and mutual understanding. One participant noted:

“Sometimes we don't agree on which product is better, but what matters is that we respect each other's views and continue to support one another.”

This statement suggests that conflict did not necessarily weaken members' attachment to the community. Instead, constructive dialogue and mutual respect helped maintain

inclusivity and strengthened interpersonal relationships among participants. Members appeared to distinguish between differences in consumption preference and their sense of belonging within the community.

Despite differences in opinion and product usage, participants consistently expressed a strong emotional connection toward Wardah Beauty Circle. Retention intention was not primarily associated with repeated purchase behavior or exclusive loyalty to Wardah products. Rather, participants described retention as an ongoing sense of connection to the community and its shared meanings. One participant expressed:

“I may use other brands, but Wardah feels like a part of my story, something I carry with me.”

This statement reflects how members differentiated between product-level loyalty and community-level attachment. Although participants explored alternative beauty brands, their emotional connection and sense of belonging within Wardah Beauty Circle remained relatively stable. Many participants explained that their attachment developed gradually through repeated interaction, shared experiences, and emotional familiarity over time.

Overall, the findings demonstrate that customer retention intention within Wardah Beauty Circle emerged through emotional safety, identity co-construction, everyday relational practices, and negotiated conflict that collectively strengthened relational continuity within the community. Rather than being driven solely by transactional loyalty, retention intention was closely connected to emotional attachment, interpersonal recognition, and a sustained sense of belonging.

## **DISCUSSION**

### **The Role of Social Safety in Strengthening Customer Retention Intention**

This study aimed to examine how customer retention intention is socially constructed within an offline brand-initiated community. The findings demonstrate that emotional safety plays a significant role in encouraging long-term engagement and relational continuity among members of Wardah Beauty Circle Denpasar. Participants consistently described the community as a supportive environment where they felt accepted, heard, and emotionally valued. This finding supports previous studies suggesting that psychological safety encourages openness, participation, and relational engagement within communal environments (Slimane & Angulo, 2019).

In the context of consumer behavior, emotional safety contributes to affective commitment and strengthens social identification with the community (Ashforth & Mael, 1989; Bhattacharya & Sen, 2003). However, the findings of this study extend earlier discussions by showing that emotional attachment was shaped not only through brand-related interaction but also through interpersonal recognition and shared emotional experiences. Members remained engaged because the community provided a sense of comfort and belonging that extended beyond transactional exchange.

From a managerial perspective, these findings suggest that organizations should prioritize emotionally supportive interaction spaces within brand communities. Companies need to facilitate communication environments that encourage openness, mutual respect, and inclusive participation among members. Nevertheless, the findings are limited to the cultural and social context of Denpasar, Bali. Future studies may therefore examine whether similar patterns emerge in other cultural settings or in digital-based brand communities.

### **Identity Co-Construction and Community Attachment**

The findings further reveal that communal identity within Wardah Beauty Circle was continuously negotiated through interaction, storytelling, and shared experiences. Participants did not merely adopt identities promoted by the brand; instead, they actively interpreted and reshaped the meaning of community participation based on personal experiences and social relationships. This finding supports earlier studies arguing that identity within brand communities is socially constructed through interaction and collective meaning-making processes (Arnould et al., 2019; Fournier & Alvarez, 2012).

Importantly, attachment to the community was not dependent on exclusive product usage. Participants associated their involvement with friendship, emotional support, and self-development rather than solely with consumption activities. This finding challenges conventional perspectives that equate customer retention with repeated purchase behavior. In this study, retention intention appeared to be more strongly connected to identity-based belonging and relational attachment.

The findings also suggest that brand communities can function as social spaces where consumers negotiate self-identity and interpersonal connection simultaneously. Companies should therefore encourage participatory activities that allow members to contribute actively to the construction of communal meaning and identity. Future research could further explore how identity negotiation differs across demographic groups, cultural backgrounds, or online and offline community settings.

### **Everyday Relational Practices and Sustained Engagement**

Another important finding concerns the role of everyday interaction practices in maintaining engagement within the community. Participants emphasized that small and routine interactions, including casual greetings, follow-up communication, and informal conversations, contributed significantly to their sense of attachment and continuity. These findings support relationship marketing and practice theory perspectives that emphasize the importance of repetitive micro-interactions in sustaining social relationships over time (Morgan & Hunt, 1994; Sohaib, 2022).

Rather than relying solely on formal events, community attachment developed gradually through consistent interpersonal interaction and emotional familiarity. Participants described their involvement as something that “grew naturally” through repeated social contact and shared experiences. This indicates that retention intention is embedded within relational routines and ongoing reciprocal engagement rather than temporary promotional activities alone.

From a managerial standpoint, organizations should maintain continuous interaction with community members beyond formal campaigns or events. Sustained communication and relational maintenance appear to be important in strengthening long-term customer attachment. Future studies may explore how digital communication platforms contribute to maintaining relational continuity in hybrid or fully online communities.

### **Negotiated Conflict and Relational Retention**

This study also demonstrates that conflict within the community did not necessarily weaken customer retention intention. Participants openly acknowledged differences in product preferences, expectations, and perspectives while continuing to maintain positive interpersonal relationships. This finding supports emerging perspectives that recognize constructive conflict as part of authentic relationship development within communities (Ramadhanasywa et al., 2025; Schoenbachler & Gordon, 2002).

Participants distinguished between product preference and community belonging. The use of competing beauty brands did not automatically reduce their emotional connection to Wardah Beauty Circle. Instead, members continued to value the interpersonal relationships and emotional support they experienced within the community. This finding further challenges transactional approaches to customer retention by demonstrating that relational continuity can persist independently from exclusive consumption behavior.

Another important insight is that constructive disagreement contributed to stronger mutual understanding among members. Open communication and mutual respect allowed participants to negotiate differences without damaging communal cohesion. In this sense, conflict became part of the relational process through which inclusivity and belonging were maintained.

From a managerial perspective, organizations should recognize that diversity of opinion and consumer preference does not necessarily threaten customer retention. Communities that provide emotionally safe environments may be better able to accommodate differences while maintaining member engagement. However, this study focused specifically on one offline beauty community in Denpasar, Bali. Future research is encouraged to investigate how negotiated conflict influences retention in different industries, cultures, and forms of consumer communities.

Overall, this study contributes to consumer behavior and brand community literature by reconceptualizing customer retention intention as a socially embedded phenomenon rooted in emotional safety, identity co-construction, everyday relational interaction, and negotiated conflict. The findings suggest that long-term retention can be strengthened not only through transactional strategies but also through meaningful relational experiences that foster belonging, interpersonal recognition, and emotional continuity within the community.

## **CONCLUSION**

This study concludes that customer retention intention within the Wardah Beauty Circle community in Denpasar is primarily shaped by relational and identity-based dynamics rather than transactional purchasing behavior. Members remain engaged because the community provides a socially safe environment where emotional expression, mutual support, and personal experiences are accepted and valued. Within this environment, identity is not merely adopted from brand messaging but continuously co-constructed through shared experiences and ongoing interaction among members.

The findings also reveal that everyday micro-interactions, such as informal conversations, follow-up communication, and reciprocal exchanges, play an important role in sustaining engagement. These routine interactions gradually transform initial participation into deeper relational commitment. In addition, differences in product preferences or interpersonal expectations do not necessarily weaken attachment to the community. When negotiated through respectful dialogue and mutual understanding, such tensions instead contribute to identity negotiation and strengthen communal resilience.

Overall, this study suggests that customer retention within brand communities should be understood as a relational process rooted in emotional safety, identity co-construction, and continuous social interaction. For practitioners, the findings highlight the importance of cultivating supportive and interaction-rich community environments rather than focusing solely on repeat-purchase strategies. Future research may further explore how

similar relational dynamics operate across different brand communities, industries, or cultural contexts.

### **LIMITATION**

This study has several limitations that should be considered when interpreting the findings. First, the research focuses on a single brand community, Wardah Beauty Circle in Denpasar, within a specific cultural setting, which may limit the transferability of the findings to other communities or contexts. Second, the study primarily involved active and long-term members, potentially creating participation bias and underrepresenting peripheral, disengaged, or former members of the community.

Third, the findings rely largely on participants' self-reported experiences obtained through interviews and observations. Although triangulation was applied to strengthen credibility, future studies could improve empirical robustness through mixed-method or longitudinal approaches incorporating behavioral indicators such as purchasing patterns, participation intensity, or advocacy behavior. Finally, this study does not fully capture the long-term evolution of community participation and retention dynamics over time. Future research is therefore encouraged to employ comparative, cross-cultural, or longitudinal designs to examine relational retention processes across different types of brand communities.

### **ACKNOWLEDGMENT**

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to all participants of Wardah Beauty Circle Denpasar who generously shared their experiences and insights during this study. Appreciation is also extended to the Wardah community representatives and experts who provided valuable perspectives that enriched this research. The authors are thankful to everyone who supported the data collection process and contributed, directly or indirectly, to the completion of this study.

### **DECLARATION OF CONFLICTING INTERESTS**

The authors declare that there are no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

### **REFERENCES**

- Abdiwan, M. (2025, May 11). *Wardah dukung event Mattpilates Higar Community, hadirkan cek kesehatan kulit gratis*. Tribun-Timur. <https://makassar.tribunnews.com/2025/05/11/wardah-dukung-event-mattpilates-higar-community-hadirkan-cek-kesehatan-kulit-gratis>
- Alhaq, F. M. (2025, March 14). *Wardah jadi pelopor tren kosmetik halal: Inovasi dan perjalanan merek lokal*. Good News From Indonesia. <https://www.goodnewsfromindonesia.id/2025/03/14/wardah-jadi-pelopor-tren-kosmetik-halal-inovasi-dan-perjalanan-merek-lokal>
- Arnould, E., Press, M., Salminen, E., & Tillotson, J. S. (2019). Consumer culture theory: Development, critique, application and prospects. *Foundations and Trends in Marketing*, 12(2), 80–166. <https://doi.org/10.1561/17000000052>
- Ashforth, B. E., & Mael, F. (1989). Social identity theory and the organization. *Academy of Management Review*, 14(1), 20–39. <https://doi.org/10.2307/258189>
- Asia, C. (2024). *Wardah Beauty jadi urutan pertama top brand kecantikan di Asia Tenggara*. Scmedia.id. <https://www.scmedia.id/wardah-beauty-jadi-urutan-pertama-top-brand-kecantikan-di-asia-tenggara/>
- Bhattacharya, C. B., & Sen, S. (2003). Consumer–company identification: A framework for understanding consumers' relationships with companies. *Journal of Marketing*, 67(2), 76–88. <https://doi.org/10.1509/jmkg.67.2.76.18609>

- Chavadi, C. A., Sirothiya, M., Menon, S. R., & M R, V. (2023). Modelling the effects of social media-based brand communities on brand trust, brand equity and consumer response. *Vikalpa: The Journal for Decision Makers*, 48(2), 114–141. <https://doi.org/10.1177/02560909231172010>
- Fitri, S., & Kumenaung, D. S. A. (2025). Brand attachment in mediating of customer experience, hedonic value, and personalized experience on customer retention. *Jurnal STEI Ekonomi*, 34(2), 179-192. <https://doi.org/10.36406/jemi.v34i2.328>
- Fournier, S., & Alvarez, C. (2012). Brands as relationship partners: Warmth, competence, and in-between. *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, 22(2), 177–185. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcps.2011.10.003>
- Hollebeek, L. D., & Macky, K. (2019). Digital content marketing's role in fostering consumer engagement, trust, and value: Framework, fundamental propositions, and implications. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, 45, 27–41. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intmar.2018.07.003>
- Huangfu, Z., Ruan, Y., Zhao, J., Wang, Q., & Zhou, L. (2022). Assessing the influence of community experience on brand loyalty toward virtual brand community: Developing country perspective. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13, Article 865646. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.865646>
- Lau, M. M., Ng, P. M. L., Chan, E. A. H., & Cheung, C. T. Y. (2023). Examining purchase intention for luxury fashion: integrating theory of reasoned action, with affect-behavior-cognition (ABC) model, identity and social identity theories. *Young Consumers*, 24(1), 114-131. <https://doi.org/10.1108/YC-07-2022-1557>
- LoyaltyLion. (2025). *What consumers want from loyalty programs 2025*. <https://loyaltylion.com/resources/consumer-loyalty-research>
- Morgan, R. M., & Hunt, S. D. (1994). The commitment-trust theory of relationship marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 58(3), 20–38. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1252308>
- Novianti, P. P., & Balqiah, T. E. (2023). The role of community benefits on brand loyalty in automotive social media brand community. *Jurnal Manajemen Teori dan Terapan*, 16(1), 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.20473/jmtt.v16i1.42435>
- Pedeliento, G., Andreini, D., & Veloutsou, C. (2020). Brand community integration, participation and commitment: A comparison between consumer-run and company-managed communities. *Journal of Business Research*, 119, 481–494. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.10.069>
- Pertiwi, W. (2024). Analisis kemampuan berpikir kritis matematis. *JURNAL MathEdu (Mathematic Education Journal)*, 7(2), 163–166. <https://doi.org/10.37081/mathedu.v7i2.5954>
- Raichur, V. G., Sharma, D., & Kalro, A. D. (2025). Customer engagement in firm-initiated and consumer-initiated online brand communities: An exploratory study. *Information Systems and e-Business Management*, 23, 169–207. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10257-023-00630-6>
- Ramadhanasywa, A., Aditya, A. S. P., Dewi, I. K., Sari, S. I. P., Utami, C. N., & Zakiyah, N. F. (2025). Pengaruh brand image, brand experience, E-WOM terhadap keputusan pembelian produk Wardah pada mahasiswa UNISRI Surakarta. *Journal of Social Science and Digital Marketing (JSSDM)*, 5(2), 107–117.
- Sa'adah, L. (2010). *Isolasi dan identifikasi senyawa tanin dari daun belimbing wuluh (Averrhoa bilimbi L.)*.
- Santos, Z. R., Cheung, C. M. K., Coelho, P. S., & Rita, P. (2022). Consumer engagement in social media brand communities: A literature review. *International Journal of Information Management*, 63, Article 102457. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2021.102457>
- Schoenbachler, D. D., & Gordon, G. L. (2002). Trust and customer willingness to provide information in database-driven relationship marketing. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, 16(3), 2–16. <https://doi.org/10.1002/dir.10033>

- Skálén, P., Cova, B., Gummerus, J., & Sihvonen, A. (2023). Marketing-as-practice: A framework and research agenda for value-creating marketing activity. *Marketing Theory*, 23(2), 185–206. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14705931221123949>
- Slimane, F. B., & Angulo, L. P. (2019). Strategic change and corporate governance: Evidence from the stock exchange industry. *Journal of Business Research*, 103, 206–218. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2018.10.045>
- Sohaib, M. (2022). An investigation of repurchase intentions in the banking industry: What reason do they return? *SAGE Open*, 12(1), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440211067228>
- Tajfel, H., & Turner, J. C. (2004). The social identity theory of intergroup behavior. In *Political psychology* (pp. 276-293). Psychology Press.
- Wongsansukcharoen, J. (2022). Effect of community relationship management, relationship marketing orientation, customer engagement, and brand trust on brand loyalty: The case of a commercial bank in Thailand. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 64, 102826. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2021.102826>
- Zhang, L., Zhou, M., & Sun, Q. (2023). Unsupervised learning for customer segmentation in fintech services. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 213, Article 118902. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2022.118902>

#### **ABOUT THE AUTHOR(S)**

##### **1<sup>st</sup> Author**

Regina Dinanti Widodo is a graduate student in the Management Study Program, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Pendidikan Nasional, Indonesia. Her academic interest include marketing management, consumer behaviour, brand activation, and sustainability studies. Email: [reginawidodo@gmail.com](mailto:reginawidodo@gmail.com) ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0009-0000-0985-0894>

##### **2<sup>nd</sup> Author**

A.A. Ngr. Oka Suryadinatha Gorda is a lecturer in the Management Study Program, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Pendidikan Nasional, Indonesia. His academic work focuses on management studies, marketing, organizational development, and human resource management. Email: [okasuryadinatha@undiknas.ac.id](mailto:okasuryadinatha@undiknas.ac.id) ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3180-2116>

##### **3<sup>rd</sup> Author**

Ngurah Keshawa Satya Santiarsa is an undergraduate student in the Management Study Program, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Pendidikan Nasional, Indonesia. His research interest include marketing management, financial management, sustainability studies, and entrepreneurship. Email: [keshawasatya@gmail.com](mailto:keshawasatya@gmail.com) ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0009-0000-1487-9368>