The Effectiveness of Instagram Advertising for Digital Marketing Strategy: Systematic Literature Review

Prahita Sri Rahayuningrat¹, Gusti Tia Ardiani², Juniar Alisa³, Rubiah Sugiarti⁴, Nuryanti Taufik⁵
Siliwangi University¹,²,³,⁴,⁵
Jl. Siliwangi no 24, Tasikmalaya, Indonesia
Correspondence Email: prahita.sri@unsil.ac.id
ORCID ID: 0009-0001-3352-8982

ABSTRACT

This systematic literature review study aims to understand the effectiveness of Instagram advertising for digital marketing. It used online data from Google Scholar and Proquest with the keywords "effectiveness" and "Instagram Advertising," which only uses papers reviewed for research. This study used PRISMA to create a systematic review. A total of 195 journal reviews were processed and then cleaned through specific criteria so that only 19 related papers were taken. From the 19 papers processed, it can be concluded that Instagram advertising is very effective in helping digital marketing. This research is expected to increase understanding for both practitioners and researchers regarding Instagram advertising and the use of PRISMA itself.

Keywords: Digital Marketing; Effectiveness; Instagram Advertising; Prisma; Strategy; Systematic Literature Review
INTRODUCTION

Today's industries have undergone a significant transformation in the way they operate and reach their customers. With the increased internet access and technological advancements, digital marketing has become a critical method for many industries to increase their revenue. Digital marketing has surpassed offline sales in volume and revenue, a phenomenon accelerated by the global pandemic that limits human mobility. During the pandemic, digital marketing experienced a significant surge as businesses shifted their focus towards online channels to reach and engage with consumers who increasingly relied on digital platforms for shopping and information. The demand for targeted online advertising, social media engagement, and e-commerce strategies intensified, highlighting the pivotal role of digital marketing in adapting to the evolving consumer landscape during challenging times. The pandemic has accelerated the transition to digital marketing, forcing industries to adapt and innovate. In this context, digital marketing has become a tool to reach customers and a platform to build stronger and more sustainable relationships with them. Digital marketing enables companies to target and reach their audiences more effectively, allowing them to deliver more personalized and relevant messages. In addition, digital marketing also allows companies to track and measure the effectiveness of their campaigns in real time, allowing them to make adjustments and improvements based on the data and feedback received.

While digital marketing offers many benefits, there are also challenges to be faced. Digital marketing faces the challenge of staying ahead in a dynamic landscape marked by evolving technologies, changing algorithms, and shifting consumer behaviors. Adapting to privacy regulations, such as GDPR and cookie restrictions, poses hurdles for targeted advertising. In addition, the saturation of online content demands constant innovation to capture and retain audience attention. The need for authentic, value-driven content amidst information overload requires marketers to strike a delicate balance. Continuous adaptation to emerging platforms, ensuring data security, and navigating the complexities of an interconnected digital ecosystem are ongoing challenges that demand agility and strategic foresight in the ever-evolving realm of digital marketing. For example, companies must deal with data privacy and security issues and stay up to date with rapid changes in technology and consumer trends. Therefore, further research is needed to understand how companies can utilize digital marketing most effectively while addressing existing challenges. This research will provide valuable insights for companies seeking digital marketing to achieve their goals.

A powerful advertising disclaimer can help consumers recognize the material as promoting and so activate their previously learned persuasion expertise and coping strategies (Vaidya & Karnawat, 2023). However, this shift is not just the result of forced circumstances. The online industry also offers convenience and comfort that traditional business models cannot match. With just a few clicks, consumers can purchase a product or service and receive it at their doorstep. This is a revolution in the way we shop and interact with businesses. Digital marketing has become a very effective tool in this online age. With the ability to target specific audiences and deliver messages tailored to individual preferences, digital marketing has helped businesses reach their customers more effectively and efficiently. It is a contemporary strategy that is indispensable for today's industry players. A visual-centric networking platform like Instagram could prove far more effective as an advertising tool for affecting customer perception along with buy desire (Teo et al., 2019). More recent, especially visual-centric social media platforms, for example Instagram, contrast with older social networking platforms which have received less attention (Teo et al., 2019).
Instagram has a rising number of engaged consumers who are of any age since its inception in 2010 (Purnama, 2020). As customers grow more acquainted with and active with social media platforms, consumers become more vulnerable to the services’ intrinsic advertising processes (Añaña & Barbosa, 2023). Instagram, is one such social networking platform. As its membership grew, it piqued the curiosity of corporate organizations, and marketing initiatives over social media platforms were launched (Teo et al., 2019). Conventional media stories and discussion can help or hurt campaigns’ desired narratives, but sponsored advertising allows for greater control over the message (Teo et al., 2019). Instagram should not just provide video content. subsequently additionally improves engagement with their target audience or following and well-known for being not only a platform for sharing everyday photographs and videos, additionally a marketplace on the internet with numerous commercial transactions (Purnama, 2020).

The development of digital technology has opened up new opportunities in marketing strategies, one of which is through Instagram Ads. Instagram ads offer businesses a visually dynamic and engaging platform to connect with its massive user base of over one billion active monthly users. Advertisers can choose from various formats like photo ads, video ads, carousel ads, and story ads, seamlessly integrating sponsored content into users’ feeds. With precise targeting options based on demographics, interests, and behaviors, businesses can tailor their messages to specific audiences. The platform's integration with Facebook's advertising tools allows for comprehensive campaign management. Instagram ads facilitate diverse call-to-action buttons, encouraging users to take specific actions, enhancing brand visibility, and driving engagement. Regular performance analysis ensures strategic optimization, making Instagram ads a powerful element within a broader digital marketing strategy. Instagram Ads have opened up new opportunities for personalization and efficiency in digital marketing strategies. With Instagram Ads, businesses can create more relevant and targeted digital marketing content, allowing them to reach their audience more effectively. Instagram Ads not only facilitates the content creation process but also increases its effectiveness. As such, the combination of online sales, digital marketing, and Instagram Ads has created a new landscape for the industry today. This landscape offers unique opportunities for growth and innovation. However, it is essential to remember that this landscape will continue to change and evolve as technology advances. Therefore, businesses must stay up to date with the latest trends and developments in technology and digital marketing strategies. By doing so, they can utilize Instagram Ads and other technologies to achieve their marketing goals more effectively. In this context, further research is needed to understand how Instagram Ads and other technologies can be used to improve the effectiveness of digital marketing strategies. This research will provide valuable insights for businesses utilizing these technologies to achieve their marketing goals.

Using systematic literature review Methodology, this article aims to identify Instagram Advertising for Digital Marketing in Indonesia with PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses) framework. Research question is to understand the effectiveness of Instagram ads for digital marketing. The PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses) framework is a set of guidelines designed to improve the transparency and quality of reporting in systematic reviews and meta-analyses. Developed to address the need for standardized reporting in the field of evidence-based medicine, PRISMA provides a structured checklist and flow diagram that researchers can follow when conducting and reporting on systematic reviews. The framework consists of 27 items covering various aspects of the review process, including the title, abstract, methods, results, discussion, and funding. These guidelines aim to enhance the clarity and completeness of systematic review reporting, ultimately facilitating the critical appraisal and interpretation of research findings by both researchers and readers. By adhering to the PRISMA framework,
authors ensure that their systematic reviews are more comprehensive, reproducible, and accessible, thereby contributing to the overall quality and reliability of evidence synthesis in healthcare and other research disciplines. Researchers, publishers, and journal editors widely endorse the use of PRISMA to standardize reporting practices and improve the robustness of systematic reviews and meta-analyses.

Table 1. Growth in the number of users of social networking sites from 2011 to 2018 (Gaber et al., 2019)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>845</td>
<td>1056</td>
<td>1228</td>
<td>1393</td>
<td>1591</td>
<td>1790</td>
<td>2100</td>
<td>2230</td>
<td>163%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instagram</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>1000%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twitter</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>305</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>326</td>
<td>335</td>
<td>186%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LITERATURE REVIEW

Digital marketing encompasses a broad range of online strategies and tactics employed by businesses to connect with their target audience, promote products or services, and achieve marketing objectives. Leveraging various digital channels such as search engines, social media, email, and websites, digital marketing aims to engage and influence potential customers in the online space. Key components include search engine optimization (SEO) to enhance online visibility, social media marketing for brand awareness and engagement, content marketing to provide valuable information, email campaigns for direct communication, and paid advertising to reach specific audiences. Analytics tools enable marketers to measure and analyze campaign performance, allowing for data-driven decision-making and continuous optimization. Digital marketing's dynamic nature adapts to evolving consumer behaviors, emphasizing personalized and interactive strategies to build meaningful relationships with the audience, drive conversions, and foster brand loyalty in the ever-expanding digital landscape.

Utilization of modern technologies and marketing based on information, particularly in online advertising, enables a broad and efficient reach (Krishen et al., 2021). Digital Marketing, it is refers to any marketing strategy that makes use of an electronic device or the internet (Desai & Vidyapeeth, 2019). When used as a digital marketing tool, blogs have been shown to increase sales income, particularly for goods that allow users to post comments about their own experiences and read reviews (Bala & Verma, 2018). One distinctive feature of digital marketing is its capacity to establish online communities for customers with similar interests (Wind & Mahajan, 2002). Adoption of novel technologies and approaches in digital advertising and marketing has resulted with greater ease, a larger reach, lower costs, and the capacity to bridge geographical and time barriers (Krishen et al., 2021). A powerful advertising disclaimer might assist consumers recognize the material as advertising and so activate their earlier acquired influence expertise and ways to cope (Evans et al., 2017). Because of digital marketing, consumer habits has shifted considerably, with current consumers demanding an increasingly regular and personalized approach (Rabby et al., 2021). A lot of companies are using Instagram in along with Facebook for marketing purposes (Teo et al., 2019).
In crafting an effective digital marketing strategy, businesses should begin by clearly defining their target audience, understanding their preferences, and creating detailed buyer personas. Next, the focus should be on producing high-quality and relevant content that aligns with the buyer's journey, addressing the audience's needs and concerns at each stage. Employing Search Engine Optimization (SEO) techniques ensures improved online visibility, while a robust social media presence on platforms relevant to the target demographic helps in building brand awareness and fostering engagement. Email marketing campaigns, tailored to segmented audiences, facilitate personalized communication and relationship-building. Leveraging paid advertising through platforms like Google Ads and social media channels enables businesses to target specific demographics and drive traffic. Throughout these efforts, consistent monitoring of analytics and key performance indicators (KPIs) is essential for assessing the strategy's effectiveness and making data-driven adjustments to optimize results continually. A comprehensive and adaptive digital marketing strategy integrates these elements to create a cohesive online presence, engage the target audience, and ultimately drive conversions and business growth.

Digital Marketing Strategy focuses on the manner in which technological advances improve the effectiveness of marketing by allowing for more personalized interest, improved managing campaigns, and stronger product, marketing design, as well as performance (Mandal & Joshi, 2017). Digital marketing strategy uses social media because it provides knowledge to small enterprise practitioners about how to expand their business (Sumarlinah et al., 2022). Acknowledging that access to information is essential for marketers to conquer the competition (Yullastuti et al., 2024). Digital marketing is tied to the most recent technological advances (Dumitriu & Popescu, 2020). Digital marketing may be defined as a method, tactics, or promotional exercise carried out via the use of digital channels, since its name implies, digital marketing involves the growth of a company, good, or service online (Mandal & Joshi, 2017). The creation of many modelling activities currently is inextricably linked to the trend of ‘cyberculture’ as an emerging culture which firmly links people and the use of technology across ensuring the long-term viability of its cultural behaviours in online settings, especially social media (Purnama, 2020). Instagram remains an artistic communication network that focuses on appearance, both individuals and businesses utilize advertising techniques using this social media site in order to acquire greater engagement or revenues (Baş and Macit, 2023). Instagram advertising may be able to address the high level of advertising reduction that a lot of customers have acquired (Gaber et al., 2019). Instagram Ads allows Brands or Products to create highly targeted adverts based on the massive demographic data. They are an important part of Instagram's attractiveness as an advertising platform and have been hailed as "extremely effective" by Instagram, Instagram demands demographic information such as age, gender, and geography among the bare essential for pursuing, nevertheless it additionally enables you to choose individuals that recently visited an organization's website as well as those that look comparable with its present consumers and Instagram advertising requirement some budget as a part from marketing budget's company (Pessala, 2016).

Effectiveness may demonstrate whether or not a firm is on track to meet its goals (Husein et al., 2021). The majority of professionals consider attitudes to be an important component of advertising efficacy / effectiveness (Khalili et al., 2022). The Preferred Reporting Items for Systematics Reviews and Meta- Analyses (PRISMA) was used to conduct to examine this research. PRISMA was created to assist systematic reviewers in publicly reporting reason the review was conducted, what the researchers performed, and what they discovered (Page et al., 2021). PRISMA emphasizes on how writers may guarantee that systematic reviews and meta-analyses are transparent and thorough (Liberati et al., 2009).
RESEARCH METHOD

Systematic reviews are required to correctly and reliably synthesize information pertaining to the effectiveness and safety of several studies (Liberati et al., 2009). A systematic literature review (SLR), as the name implies, is a method of gathering, critically analyzing, integrating, and displaying data from various research papers on a certain research issue or topic of relevance. It is "systematic" because it follows an established and well understood technique. The technique should handle quality problems like as bias, replication, trustworthiness, and so on, SLR allows you to examine the quality and amount of available proof on a certain subject or issue of your concern. It provides a more comprehensive and accurate degree of information than a standard literature study (Pati & Lorusso, 2018).

A procedure has become a vital part of the systematic review method; that helps to guarantee the systematic review has been carefully organized and that every aspect of exactly what has been discussed remains clearly captured prior the analysis begins, encouraging in accordance review team actions, reliability, integrity of research, and full disclosure of the final completed review (Moher et al., 2015). A 27-item checklist and a four-phase flow diagram comprise the PRISMA Statement and the list of items consists of things considered necessary for transparent systematic review reporting (Liberati et al., 2009). The final PRISMA-P 2015 list has 17 listed elements divided into three major sections: administration information, introduction, and technique (Moher et al., 2015). In 2020, PRISMA has been update to 27 Checklist items and 12 abstract checklist items (Page et al., 2021). We did a comprehensive search across systematic literature reviews undertaken by researchers and utilize of a dataset established for a larger effort to examine the accuracy of systematic literature reviews; a thorough literature review was undertaken in accordance with the PRISMA protocol. The following processes were used to identify papers: scanning of identifiable documents in citation databases; evaluation of possibly related articles; and the submission of criteria for eligibility to choose those that were included papers (Silva et al., 2015). A protocol was prepared in advance to record the analytic process and inclusion criteria in order to build the core dataset. Google scholar and ProQuest were used to look for papers that were published in the quality list and included the word "review" in their titles, abstracts, or keywords. The search was conducted on November 1, 2023, with no date limits and just English and Indonesia language restrictions. The present research did not utilize the keyword "systematic" as a keyword in order to find systematic reviews that did not use the word "systematic." A trial run was done on 20 randomly selected included articles to improve the retrieved elements and coding appropriately. Following that, all relevant publications were thoroughly evaluated in order to gather and code the information that was provided (Sharif et al., 2019).
Results

Instagram, which was formed in 2010, represents a such social network site. As its membership increased, it drew the interest of business organizations, and advertising initiatives were started on the social network (Teo et al., 2019). Reports and comments in the traditional media may assist or hurt campaigns' desired storylines, whereas sponsored advertising allows for more power regarding the content (Rychert & Wilkins, 2023). Instagram advertising has a beneficial influence effect revenues, due to the study's findings, investing cash on Instagram advertising might enhance revenues (Yantian et al., 2022). When examining parent, youth, and young adult screenr research, Facebook and Instagram advertising had the highest penetration and smallest expense per survey start (Villanti et al., 2020). The Instagram has played an important role in promoting the presence of goods in the distribution for the goods offered by the company. People can effortlessly connect since these platforms allow users to learn about the good in a less obvious manner, without hunting seeking the good directly, but rather being conscious of any innovation (Ortiz, 2020). The results demonstrated that disclosure phrasing using the phrase "Paid Ads" positively increased ad recognition (Vaidya & Karnawat, 2023). Advertising through internet media has become far more successful over advertising through print media; online media advertising generates three times the impact of the revenue of traditional media. They advised using social media for marketing in order to enhance sales volume (Lin et al., 2021). According to

Figure 1. Overview Result

Identification of studies via databases

Record identified through database searching google scholars (n= 170)

Record identified through other database searching (proquest) (n= 25)

Record after duplicates removed (n=195)

Records screened (n=195)

Records exclude (can be downloaded) (n= 103)

Full-text articles assessed for eligibility (n=92)

Studies included in qualitative synthesis (n = 30)

Full-Text article excluded, with reasons: Not in English nor Bahasa, Book Chapter Not paper Reviewed (n=72)

Studies include in quantitative synthesis (meta-analysis) (n=18)
research, buyers who detect advertising through paid blogs employ psychological reactance tactics and counter-argumentation, resulting in an influence on business associated feelings and intents, the "Paid Ad" wording is the most successful at raising advertisement awareness. (Evans et al., 2017). Instagram advertising had a strong effect on buy impulse from customer perception, just as it has a big affect on consumer perception (Suprapto et al., 2020). The most vital component of digital marketing is connecting with users (Panda and Mishra, 2021). The advertising effectiveness factor, that incorporates feelings of compassion parameters, might clarify 48.7% of consumer purchasing attraction, with the rest 51.3% explained by various additional variables (Putra et al., 2018).

According to Arya and kerti, Advertising credibility is linked to customers' views of truth and trust, which has a direct impact on advertising efficacy. They discovered a considerable positive influence of informativeness on perceived advertisement value. (Arya & Kerti, 2020). Instagram advertising shown to be efficient or effective in favorably influencing consumers' perceptions toward the company (Setijanto et al., 2023). Instagram advertising helps to raise brand exposure together with purchase decision (Diantari & Jokhu, 2021). Consumers' good sentiments of Instagram advertising are influenced by their impression of entertainment. Personalization of Instagram adverts significantly improves customers' opinions about these advertisements. Positive sentiments regarding Instagram commercials favorably affect consumers' attitudes toward brands, thus explained that Instagram advertisements is very effective for customer’s interaction with brands (Gaber et al., 2019). The efficacy of ads is greatly influenced by social media platforms. Furthermore, customer connection to a social media platform stretches beyond their interaction with the site's advertising, which eventually influences their evaluations of the adverts. According to the findings, a good opinion toward Instagram advertising increases purchase intent (Añaña & Barbosa, 2023).

The effectiveness of social media advertising is conceived as a notion that encompasses emotional attractiveness, data presentation, innovation, and engagement, among other factors which are believed to have the ability to lead positive online actions (Khajavi et al., 2020). The results provide the spotlight on Instagram's success as a marketing tool and give vital data for organizations looking to use it (Bhinde et al., 2023). Furthermore, Instagram advertising may use the forecasting results to improve their ad allocation algorithm and better control the volume of network traffic, the new study provides a practical contribution by predicting the impact of instagram advertising commercials in advance. This is extremely beneficial to the advancement of the Instagram advertising market (Chen, 2022).

DISCUSSION

This research reviewed 19 review papers; the research process has been carried out. We understand that Instagram advertising is a very effective way to communicate with consumers. This is because Instagram offers extensive demographic and interest data, and companies can choose the duration of the ad. As an organization, they can choose to run their ads for just one day or for as long as the company needs them.

The results show that social media users respond well to expressive visual aesthetics and richer presentation modalities. The findings also have important implications for government agencies, non-profit organizations, and others who promote social messages and public service advertisements using social media. However, this research goes beyond these insights. We also tried to dig deeper into how Instagram, a social media platform, can be optimally used in an organization's marketing strategy. We
evaluated various factors, such as the timing of ads, the type of content displayed, and how interactions between users and ads can affect consumer perception and behavior. In addition, we also tried to understand how organizations can leverage the unique features offered by Instagram, such as Instagram Stories and IGTV, to create more immersive and meaningful experiences for consumers.

As a result, this research seeks to provide new and practical insights for organizations looking to leverage Instagram as part of their marketing strategy and other researchers interested in exploring this topic more. Furthermore, it is essential to remember that this research is not the end of this exploration. Instead, it is the first step in a long and complex journey to understand how to utilize Instagram and other social media to achieve our marketing goals. Therefore, we encourage other researchers to continue this work and explore various aspects of this topic.

CONCLUSION

As mentioned earlier, systematic reviews provide an essential channel for scientists and practitioners to utilize the latest information for future action (e.g., policy) and exploration. In this regard, guidelines covering systematic reviews guarantee that they are robust enough to offer realistic debates and conclusions (both objective and trustworthy) that might drive future actions (Sharif et al., 2019). Compared to the other dimensions tested, Facebook, YouTube, and Instagram users value the informative dimension the most. To influence purchasing behavior, business enterprises should emphasize each variable, including informativeness, hedonic inspiration, credibility, and economic benefits (Karadeniz & Kocamaz, 2019).

However, this research goes beyond these understandings. We also investigate how companies can utilize this informative dimension to create more effective marketing strategies. We evaluate various factors, such as the type of content displayed, how it is presented, and how the interaction between users and content can affect consumer perception and behavior. In addition, we also tried to understand how companies can utilize the unique features offered by these social media platforms, such as Facebook Live, YouTube Premieres, and Instagram Stories, to create more immersive and meaningful experiences for consumers. As a result, this research seeks to provide new and practical insights for companies looking to utilize social media as part of their marketing strategy and other researchers interested in exploring this topic more.

Customer behavior refers to the cognitive processes involved in product search, selection, and customer purchase (Kaur et al., 2023), and advertising is part of product search. Therefore, companies must understand how this behavior can be influenced by the informative dimension and how they can leverage this understanding to create more effective marketing strategies.

LIMITATION

This research project focuses only on qualitative analysis. This research can be redone with quantitative analysis. Other dynamics may be revealed through case studies, research, or content analysis of posts. Other social networking sites, such as Facebook, Twitter, and others, could also be considered. This study only collected data from Google Scholar and ProQuest. Other options that can be used through Scopus or Lens might be considered for examination. Nevertheless, this research goes beyond such understandings. We also tried to dig deeper into how quantitative analysis can provide new and different insights into this topic. We evaluated various factors, such as the type of data collected, the data collection method, and how the data was analyzed. However, it is essential to remember that quantitative analysis is not the end of this exploration.
Instead, it is the first step in a long and complex journey to understand how to utilize this data to gain a better and more in-depth understanding of this topic. Therefore, we encourage other researchers to continue this work and explore various aspects of this topic. In addition, we also try to understand how the methods of data collection and analysis can affect the study results. For example, can specific data collection methods lead to more accurate or informative results? Are there other ways to analyze the data that can provide deeper or different insights? Finally, we also try to understand how the results of this research can be used in practice. For example, how can the results of this research be used by practitioners or policymakers to make better or more effective decisions? How can the results of this research help us understand and address existing challenges or problems in society?

As such, this research seeks to provide new and practical insights for other researchers interested in exploring this topic further. We also try to understand how case studies, research, or content analysis of posts can provide a deeper understanding of the dynamics at hand. We also tried to understand how other social networking sites like Facebook and Twitter can provide different and unique insights. As a result, this research seeks to provide new and practical insights for other researchers interested in exploring this topic further. However, it is essential to remember that this research is not the end of this exploration. Instead, it is the first step in a long and complex journey to understand how we can utilize quantitative and qualitative analysis and various other methods and tools to gain a better and more in-depth understanding of this topic. Therefore, we encourage other researchers to continue this work and explore various aspects of this topic.

REFERENCES


Evans, N. J., Phua, J., Lim, J., & Jun, H. (2017). Disclosing Instagram influencer advertising: The effects of disclosure language on advertising recognition,


Villanti, A. C., Vallencourt, C. P., West, J. C., Peasley-Miklus, C., LePine, S. E., McCluskey, C., Klemperer, E., Priest, J. S., Logan, A., Patton, B., Erickson, N.,


Yuliastuti, I. A. N. (2024). Family welfare of micro, small and medium entrepreneurs (a literature study review of economics). *Journal of The Community Development in Asia, 7*(1), 105-120. https://doi.org/10.32535/jcda.v7i1.2576